

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION
CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA
Lower Level – Room 40, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard
October 23, 2008

Present: Diane Trout-Oertel, Lee Meyer, Mark Shepherd Thomas, Steve Tremble, Carol Carey, Pat Igo, Susan Bartlett Foote, April Haas, Paul Larson

Absent: Susan Bartlett Foote, Richard Faricy, Carole Kralicek, John Manning, Shari Taylor Wilsey

Staff Present: Amy Spong, Christine Barr, Cory Rucker

CALL TO ORDER: 5:05 PM by Paul Larson (Chair)

- 1. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA:** Agenda was approved as submitted 7-0 (**Haas, Trout-Oertel**).
- 2. CONFLICT OF INTEREST:** None were stated.
- 3. PERMIT REVIEW/PUBLIC HEARING**

A. 435 Portland Avenue, Hill Historic District, by Kal Construction, Inc., for a building permit to remove the detached garage and construct a rear addition to the main house with an attached garage. **File #09-001** (Barr, 266-9067).

Staff read the report recommending conditional approval of the application. Staff showed photos of the property and of the work which was to be completed. The applicant Marschall Smith and the contractor Khalid Effendi were present to speak on behalf of the owner. The applicant was more than willing to follow staff recommendations and guidelines set forth in order to obtain approval of the proposed addition. The commission had questions about the placement of windows on the new addition of the garage and made suggestions in regards to the placement of windows and a door to be placed on the garage for entry from outside. The applicant agreed to work with staff and submit photos of any proposed door to be used in replacement of a French style door.

Commissioner Carey motioned for approval of staff recommendations. The motion was seconded by commissioner Hass. Motion passed 7-0.

B. 300 Bates Avenue, Dayton's Bluff Historic District, by Gallop Solutions, owner, for a building permit to install a solid door at the front elevation in order to eliminate a recessed storefront entry. **File #09-002** (Spong, 266-9079).

Staff read the report recommending conditional approval of the application. Staff showed pictures of the property and the proposed changes to be made to a recessed front door. The applicant Becky Bohler was present to speak and sated that the need for the door to be replaced stems from negative behavior that takes place after normal business hours. The current recessed door on the building allows for individuals to secretly urinate without being exposed. The applicant also stated that the company did not have any money to repair or replace the current door setup due to a lack of business and revenue. Meyer questioned the use of the word storefront because the storefront is no longer present and staff explained that the guidelines for storefronts still apply because of the original design intent of the building.

Staff and commissioners stated there are other ways and means to go about making a problem property safer and reduce negative behavior while still adding to the neighborhood and its characteristics while staying within the guidelines of the Dayton's Bluff Historic District. Commissioner Trimble stated that even though it was a bad situation to be in, there needs to be some consistency when it comes to HPC guidelines and the decisions rendered by the commission

as a whole. He also noted that motions should not be influenced by input such as the statement made in this case of “lack of money” or “financing”. He noted that this would undermine the HPC and its goals and vision over the long run making such condescending and contradictory approvals and disapprovals. There was some confusion amongst the applicant and commissioners as to the proper use of the building and what guidelines must be followed in the redeveloped process. The applicant stated that earlier in the day she had spoken with Historic St. Paul about getting aid or financial help in order to make proper upgrades to the building, but was not able to get the help and answers needed on such short notice.

Commissioner Meyer motioned for approval while commissioner Haas seconded the motion. The motion was amended to say the applicant work with staff and Historic St. Paul before the permit is approved to seek a better design solution. The amended motion passed 5-1-1 with commissioner Carey abstaining and Commissioner Trimble voting against the motion. Staff findings 1, 3, 5, were eliminated from staff findings and 2, and four were kept to support amended motion.

4. HISTORIC RESOURCE REVIEW: There were no reviews to consider.

5. NEW BUSINESS: There was a brief discussion about the 3M site on the East Side.

6. ADJOURN: 6:55 P.M.

Submitted by: Cory Rucker